

JASON B. BINFORD
Texas Bar No. 24045499
ABIGAIL R. RYAN
Texas Bar No. 24035956
LAYLA D. MILLIGAN
Texas State Bar No. 24026015
ROMA N. DESAI
S.D.N.Y. Bar Number RD8227
Texas Bar No. 24095553
Assistant Attorneys General
Bankruptcy & Collections Division
P. O. Box 12548
Austin, Texas 78711-2548
P: (512) 463-2173/F: (512) 936-1409
jason.binford@oag.texas.gov
abigail.ryan@oag.texas.gov
layla.milligan@oag.texas.gov
roma.desai@oag.texas.gov

ATTORNEYS FOR THE TEXAS STATE SECURITIES BOARD AND
THE TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF BANKING

**UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

In re:

VOYAGER DIGITAL HOLDINGS, INC., *et al.*¹,

Debtors.

Chapter: 11

Case No. 22-10943 (MEW)

(Jointly Administered)

**SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION TO THE TEXAS STATE SECURITIES
BOARD'S AND THE TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF BANKING'S LIMITED
OBJECTION TO THE DEBTORS' MOTION FOR ENTRY OF AN ORDER (I)
AUTHORIZING ENTRY INTO THE ASSET PURCHASE AGREEMENT AND (II)
GRANTING RELATED RELIEF**

Dkt. No. 535

The Texas State Securities Board (“SSB”) and the Texas Department of Banking (“DOB”), by and through the Office of the Texas Attorney General (“Texas”), hereby files the attached Declaration in support of its Objection (the “Objection”) to the *Debtors’ Motion for Entry of an Order Approving (I) the Adequacy of the Amended Disclosure Statement, (II) Solicitation and Notice Procedures, (III)*

¹ The Debtors in these chapter 11 cases, along with the last four digits of each Debtor’s federal tax identification number, are: Voyager Digital Holdings, Inc. (7687); Voyager Digital Ltd. (7224); and Voyager Digital, LLC (8013). The location of the Debtors’ principal place of business is 33 Irving Place, Suite 3060, New York, NY 10003.

Forms of Ballots and Notices in Connection Therewith, and (IV) Certain Dates with Respect Thereto

[D.E. 289].

[Remainder of Page Intentionally Left Blank]

Dated: October 14, 2022,

Respectfully submitted,

KEN PAXTON
Attorney General of Texas

BRENT WEBSTER
First Assistant Attorney General

GRANT DORFMAN
Deputy First Assistant Attorney General

SHAWN E. COWLES
Deputy Attorney General for Civil Litigation

RACHEL R. OBALDO
Assistant Attorney General
Chief, Bankruptcy & Collections Division

/s/ Abigail Ryan

JASON B. BINFORD
Texas State Bar No. 24045499

LAYLA D. MILLIGAN
Texas State Bar No. 24026015

ABIGAIL R. RYAN
Texas State Bar No. 24035956

ROMA N. DESAI
S.D.N.Y. Bar Number RD8227

Texas Bar No. 24095553
Office of the Attorney General of Texas
Bankruptcy & Collections Division
P. O. Box 12548

Austin, Texas 78711-2548

Telephone: (512) 463-2173

Facsimile: (512) 936-1409

jason.binford@oag.texas.gov

layla.milligan@oag.texas.gov

abigail.ryan@oag.texas.gov

roma.desai@oag.texas.gov

ATTORNEYS FOR THE TEXAS STATE SECURITIES BOARD
AND THE TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF BANKING

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been served via the Court's Electronic Filing System on all parties requesting notice in this proceeding on October 14, 2022.

/s/ Abigail Ryan
ABIGAIL RYAN
Assistant Attorney General

**UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

In re:

VOYAGER DIGITAL HOLDINGS, INC., *et al.*¹,
Debtors.

Chapter: 11

Case No. 22-10943 (MEW)

(Jointly Administered)

**DECLARATION OF JOSEPH JASON ROTUNDA
DIRECTOR OF ENFORCEMENT OF THE TEXAS STATE SECURITIES BOARD**

My name is Joseph Jason Rotunda. I am over eighteen (18) years of age and competent to testify to the matters included in this declaration. I am making this declaration voluntarily and based upon my personal knowledge.

I graduated from Trinity University in San Antonio, Texas, in 1997. I obtained my juris doctorate from the University of Kansas School of Law in Lawrence, Kansas, in 2000. I am currently licensed as an attorney in Texas.

I am employed as the Director of Enforcement Division of the Texas State Securities Board (“Enforcement Division”) and have been continuously employed in this capacity since 2007. I am responsible for the operation and work of the Enforcement Division. As such, I supervise approximately thirty attorneys, financial examiners, and other employees assigned to offices in Austin, Texas; Corpus Christi, Texas; Dallas, Texas; and Houston, Texas.

In my capacity as Director of Enforcement, I am familiar with this bankruptcy proceeding. I am also familiar with a contested case filed by the Enforcement Division against Voyager Digital LTD, Voyager Digital Holdings, Inc. and Voyager Digital LLC. The contested case commenced on

¹ The Debtors in these chapter 11 cases, along with the last four digits of each Debtor’s federal tax identification number, are: Voyager Digital Holdings, Inc. (7687); Voyager Digital Ltd. (7224); and Voyager Digital, LLC (8013). The location of the Debtors’ principal place of business is 33 Irving Place, Suite 3060, New York, NY 10003.

April 12, 2022, with the filing of a Notice of Hearing with the State Office of Administrative Hearings in SOAH Docket No. 312-22-2244. The Notice of Hearing accused these parties of offering yield-bearing depository accounts regulated as securities in Texas, violating Section 4004.051 of the Securities Act (offers without first being registered as dealers or agents) and Section 4003.001 (selling unregistered or nonpermitted securities), and making offers containing statements that were materially misleading or otherwise likely to deceive the public as set forth in Section 4007.103. The Enforcement Division is praying for a proposal for decision for the entry of a cease and desist order and a cease publication order. The contested case is pending.

I am also familiar with FTX Trading LTD (“FTX Trading”) dba FTX as described herein. As more fully explained throughout this declaration, I am aware that FTX Trading, along with West Realm Shires Services Inc. dba FTX US (“FTX US”), may be offering unregistered securities in the form of yield-bearing accounts to residents of the United States. These products appear similar to the yield-bearing depository accounts offered by Voyager Digital LTD et al., and the Enforcement Division is now investigating FTX Trading, FTX US, and their principals, including Sam Bankman-Fried.

I understand that FTX Trading is incorporated in Antigua and Barbuda and headquartered in the Bahamas. It was organized and founded in part by Mr. Bankman-Fried, and FTX Trading appears to be restricting operations in the United States. For example, domestic users accessing the webpage for FTX Trading at ftx.com are presented with a pop-up window that contains a disclaimer that reads in part as follows:

Did you mean to go to FTX US? FTX US is a US licensed cryptocurrency exchange that welcomes American users.

You’re accessing FTX from the United States. You won’t be able to use any of FTX.com’s services, though you’re welcome to look around the site.

FTX US claims to be regulated as a Money Services Business with FinCEN (No. 31000195443783) and as a money transmitter, a seller of payment instruments and in other non-securities capacities in many different states. It is not, however, registered as a money transmitter or in any other capacity with the Texas Department of Banking and it is not registered as a securities dealer with the Texas State Securities Board.

FTX US owns 75 percent or more of the outstanding equity of FTX Capital Markets (CRD No. 158816) ("FTX Capital"), a firm registered as a broker-dealer with the United States Securities and Exchange Commission, the Financial Industry Regulatory Authority Inc., and 53 state and territorial securities regulators. FTX Capital's registration as a dealer in Texas became effective on May 7, 2012, and the registration continues to remain in force and effect.

FTX US maintains a website at <https://ftx.us> that contains [a webpage](#) for smartphone applications for FTX (formerly Blockfolio)² (the "FTX Trading App") and FTX US Pro. Users appear able to click a link in this webpage to download the FTX Trading App even when they reside in the United States.

On October 14, 2022, I downloaded and installed the FTX Trading App on my smartphone. I created an account with FTX Trading through the FTX Trading App and linked the FTX account to an existing personal bank account. During the process, I provided my full first and last name and entered my residential address in Austin, Texas. I also accessed hyperlinks in the FTX Trading App that redirected to the Privacy Policy and Terms of Service. Although I was from the United States and was using the application tied to FTX Trading, the Privacy Policy and Terms of Service were from FTX US - not FTX Trading.

² Based upon information and belief, FTX Trading acquired Blockfolio LLC ("Blockfolio") in or around August 2020. At the time, Blockfolio managed a cryptocurrency application. FTX Trading appears to have thereafter rebranded Blockfolio and its smartphone application as FTX. Now, users can download the FTX Trading App from Apple's App Store or Google's Google Play Store. Although FTX rebranded Blockfolio, the application listing in Apple's App Store still shows the application with developed by Blockfolio.

I thereafter used the FTX Trading App to initiate the transfer of \$50.00 from my bank account to the FTX account and then transferred .1 ETH from a 3.0 wallet to the FTX account. The transfer of funds from my bank account to the FTX account will take up to six days to complete but the transfer of ETH was processed within a few minutes.

The FTX Trading App showed that I was eligible to earn a yield on my deposits. It also explained the “Earn program is provided by FTX.US” – not FTX Trading.³ It also represented that “FTX Earn rewards are available for US users on a promotional basis.”

I recall the FTX Trading App’s default settings were automatically configured to enable the earning of yield. The application also contained a link for additional information about yield. I accessed the link and was redirected to [a recent article](#) published by “Blockfolio Rebecca” under help.blockfolio.com. The article began as follows:

You can now earn yield on your crypto purchases and deposits, as well as your fiat balances, in your FTX Trading App! By opting in and participating in staking your supported assets in your FTX account, you’ll be eligible to earn up to 8% APY on your staked assets. THIS APY IS ESTIMATED AND NOT GUARANTEED AS DESCRIBED BELOW.

The article also described the payment of yield. It contained a section titled *How do you calculate APY? Does my balance compound daily?* that read, in part, as follows:

FTX will deposit yield earnings from the staked coins, calculated hourly, on the investment portfolio that is stored in your FTX Trading App. Yield will be

³ The Terms of Use and Privacy Policy accessible through help.blockfolio.com specifically state that other affiliated parties may be providing trading and investment opportunities, and perhaps more robust financial services, through the smartphone application. Services include access to financial services, such as trading and investment opportunities (“FTX App Trading”), for users who meet certain qualifications. The FTX App Trading services are provided by FTX Trading, Ltd., an Antigua And Barbuda limited liability company (“FTX”) and its affiliated companies.

compounded on principal and yield you have already earned. Any cryptocurrency that you have deposited on FTX as well as any fiat balance you may have on your account, will earn yield immediately after you have opted into the program.

The first \$10,000 USD value in your deposit wallets will earn 8% APY. Amounts held above \$10,000 up to \$10MM USD in value (subject to market fluctuations) will earn 5% APY. In this scenario, your yield earned on the coins will look something like the examples below the table.

The article also contained a section titled *Is this available in my country?* This section explained that “FTX Trading App Earn is available to FTX Trading App customers that are in one of the FTX permitted jurisdictions.” It contained a hyperlink to [an article](#) titled *Location Restrictions* published by FTX Crypto Derivatives Exchange under help.ftx.com. This article described various restrictions on operations in certain countries and locations and read in part as follows:

FTX does not onboard or provide services to corporate accounts of entities located in, established in, or a resident of the **United States of America, Cuba, Crimea and Sevastopol, Luhansk People's Republic, Donetsk People's Republic, Iran, Afghanistan, Syria, or North Korea**. FTX also does not onboard corporate accounts located in or a resident of **Antigua or Barbuda**. FTX also does not onboard any users from Ontario, and FTX does not permit non-professional investors from Hong Kong purchasing certain products.

FTX does not onboard or provide services to personal accounts of current residents of the United States of America, Cuba, Crimea and Sevastopol, Luhansk People's Republic, Donetsk People's Republic, Iran, Afghanistan, Syria, North Korea, or Antigua and Barbuda. There may be partial restrictions in other jurisdictions, potentially including Hong Kong, Thailand, Malaysia, India and

Canada. In addition, FTX does not onboard any users from Ontario, does not permit non-professional investors from Hong Kong purchasing certain products, and does not offer derivatives products to users from Brazil.

FTX serves all Japanese residents via FTX Japan.

(emphasis in original)

Despite the fact I identified myself by name and address, the FTX Trading App now shows that I am earning yield on the ETH. The yield is valued at 8 percent APR.

Based upon my earning of yield and an ongoing investigation by the Enforcement Division of the Texas State Securities Board, the yield program appears to be an investment contract, evidence of indebtedness and note, and as such appears to be regulated as a security in Texas as provided by Section 4001.068 of the Texas Securities Act. At all times material to the opening of this FTX account, FTX Trading and FTX US have not been registered to offer or sell securities in Texas. FTX Trading and FTX US may therefore be violating Section 4004.051 of the Texas Securities Act. Moreover, the yield program described herein has not been registered or permitted for sale in Texas as generally required by Section 4003.001 of the Securities Act, and as such FTX Trading and FTX US may be violation Section 4003.001 by offering unregistered or unpermitted securities for sale in Texas. Finally, FTX Trading and FTX US may not be fully disclosing all known material facts to clients prior to opening accounts and earning yield, thereby possibly engaging in fraud and/or making offers containing statements that are materially misleading or otherwise likely to deceive the public. Certain principals of FTX Trading and FTX US may also be violating these statutes and disclosure requirements. Further investigation is necessary to conclude whether FTX Trading, FTX US and others are violating the Securities Act through the acts and practices described in this declaration.

The Enforcement Division of the Texas State Securities Board understands that FTX US placed the highest bid for assets of Voyager Digital LTD et al., a family of companies variously accused of

misconduct in connection with the sale of securities similar to the yield program promoted by FTX Trading and FTX US. FTX US is managed by Sam Bankman-Fried (CEO and Founder), Gary Wang (CTO and Founder) and Nishad Singh (Head of Engineering). The same principals hold the same positions at FTX Trading, and I was able to access the yield-earning product after following a link to the FTX Trading App from FTX US's website. The FTX Trading App also indicated the Earn program is provided by FTX US. As such, FTX US should not be permitted to purchase the assets of the debtor unless or until the Securities Commissioner has an opportunity to determine whether FTX US is complying with the law and related and/or affiliated companies, including companies commonly controlled by the same management, are complying with the law.

I hereby authorize the Texas Attorney General's Office and any of its representatives to use this declaration in this bankruptcy proceeding.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on October 14, 2022 in Austin, Texas.

/s Joseph Jason Rotunda

By: Joseph Jason Rotunda